

*The Economics of Inequality in an Agrarian Society:  
Landownership, Land Tenure, Population Processes  
and the Rate of Rent in 1930's China*

DISSERTATION

Linda Gail Arrigo  
Department of Sociology  
State University of New York at Binghamton

May 9, 1996

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract iv  
Dedication viii  
Acknowledgements ix  
Table of Contents x  
How to Read this Thesis xix  
List of Datasets xxii  
Maps xxxii

INTRODUCTION

The Subject of the Research: A Holistic Analysis  
of Agrarian Society 1  
  
Issues of the Research Framework 5  
*Does Man Live by "Exploitation" or "Efficiency"?* 5  
*How to Balance the Land/Labor Market?* 8  
*The Question of Time:  
How Do You Make a Process Stand Still?* 10  
  
Meaning from Quantitative Methods 12  
*Substantial versus Formal Mathematical Modelling* 13  
*Causality — Chicken or the Egg?* 15  
*Research Tools and Tactics* 16

PART ONE THE CLASS RELATIONS OF REPRODUCTION  
AND THE DETERMINATION OF THE  
LANDOWNERSHIP DISTRIBUTION 19

Chapter 1 A Model of How the Differential Reproduction of Classes  
Determines the Landownership Distribution 20

1.0 Introduction to Part One 20  
1.1 A Just-So Story 25  
1.2 Specifying the Relationship Between Reproduction and the  
Landownership Distribution: A Computer Simulation 34  
*Initial Conditions of the Simulation* 35  
*Stage One: Equal Reproduction  
Regardless of Landownership* 36  
*Measurements of Inequality* 39  
*Stage Two: Reproduction Proportional to Landownership* 42  
*Stage Three: The Rich Get Richer* 46  
*The Implications of the Computer Simulation* 51  
1.3 Landownership Distribution, Bangladesh 1978 55  
1.4 Mechanisms that Maintain Differential Reproduction  
of Classes: Why Female Infanticide? 59

**Chapter 2 Population Processes in Pre-1949 China 62**

- 2.0 Introduction 62
- 2.1 Sources of Data for Analysis of Chinese Population Dynamics 66
- 2.2 Social Reproduction is not Biological Reproduction: Early Ethnographic Accounts of Female Infanticide and Child Sale 71
- 2.3 Landownership & Age at Marriage in North China — Gamble 77
- 2.4 Indications of Allocation of Women's Reproductive Power — Buck and Notestein 1937 79
- 2.5 Rented Land and Reproductive Strategies — Notestein 85
- 2.6 Class Differentials of Female Fertility in an Area with Much Rented Land, Taiwan — Wolf 1985 90
- 2.7 Class Differentials of Reproduction and Mortality in an Area with Much Rented Land, Lower Yangtze Delta — Chiao, Thompson and Chen 92
- 2.8 Childhood Mortality by Economic Class and Education of Parents — Lamson and Griffing 98
- 2.9 Poor Women are Wives for the Rich, Poor Men are Labor — Chinese Farm Economy, Buck 1930 101  
*Introduction* 101  
*Economic Status of Locality and Average Number of Sons* 107  
*Population Pyramids: Migration of Males and Transfer of Women among Economic Classes* 116
- 2.10 The Whole Picture, On the Ground 135  
*Introduction* 135  
*Population Density & Sex Ratios: Supply of Labor to the Cities* 137  
*Male-Heavy Marginal Populations* 142  
*Reproductive Capacities and Strategies under Separation from the Means of Production* 143
- 2.11 Relating Regional Demographic Differences to Agricultural Productivity — the Notestein Archives 151
- 2.12 The Process of Accumulation of Land over the Life Cycle — Buck, Chinese Farm Economy, 1930 159
- 2.13 The Stability of the Landownership Distribution over Time — Lavelly and Wong 166

**Chapter 3 Comparison across Cultures and Histories: Population Processes in Turn-of-the-Century Russia and Contemporary South Asia 173**

- 3.0 Introduction: The South Asian Demographic Literature 173  
*Demographic Indicators and the Specifics of Female Infanticide by Economic Class* 175  
*Reasoning about Transitions in Demographic Patterns* 177
- 3.1 Fertility, Child Mortality and Joint Family Formation — Edwin Driver, India 179
- 3.2 Fertility and Child and Adult Mortality by Economic Indicators — The Matlab Project, Bangladesh 182
- 3.3 A View on Reproduction, Mortality and Sex Ratios — Krishnaji, India 187
- 3.4 Locating Female Infanticide and Neglect in Relation to Landownership — Intensive Village Studies in India by George et al. and Wadley 190
- 3.5 The Value of Women's and Children's Labor in Relation to Landownership — Cain, Bangladesh 194
- 3.6 Russian Debates on the Nature of Peasant Differentiation: Lenin versus Chayanov 198
- 3.7 Russian Surveys on Peasant Differentiation, Household Change, and Social Mobility, 1880-1925 — Shanin 203
- 3.8 Small Bangladeshi Surveys on Peasant Differentiation, Household Change, and Social Mobility, 1930-1980 — van Schendel and Cain 225

**PART TWO THE DETERMINATION OF  
GEOGRAPHICAL PATTERNS OF LAND TENURE 233**

**CHAPTER 4 A Model of How Productivity and Population Density  
Determine Land Tenure Patterns 234**

- 4.0 Introduction to Part Two 234
- 4.1 A Just-So Story of Landownership Distribution and Land/ Labor Relations: The Proportion of Land Farmed by Non-Owner 237
- 4.2 Variation in Level of Production and its Effect on the Proportion of Land Farmed by Non-Owner 242
- 4.3 The Cost of Leisure and Differentiation in the Forms of Land/Labor Relations 244
- 4.4 The Friction of Transport and its Impact on the Forms of Land/Labor Relations 247
- 4.5 Hypothetical Surveys of a Just-So Village: From Land-ownership Distribution to Farm Size Distribution 250

**CHAPTER 5 Geographical Patterns of the Chinese Agricultural Economy:  
Productivity, Population Density, Land Tenure 257**

- 5.0 Introduction 257
- 5.1 The Patterns of Land Tenure in Prerevolutionary China 260
  - Gradations of Landownership, Alienation from the Means of Production, and Extraction of the Surplus 261*
  - The Size of the Surplus and the Concentration of Ownership as Measured in Tenanted Land: Why the Relationship? 262*
  - The Great Debate on Inequality in Prerevolutionary China: Ideological Perspectives and Research Tactics 265*
- 5.2 The Rationale for Regional Variation in Land Tenure Patterns 274
  - A Rough Interregional Comparison of Income Levels and Rural Inequality 274*
  - Tenants versus Hired Labor: Commonality and Differentiation in the Forms of Land/Labor Relations 277*
  - The Effect of the Friction of Transport on Land Tenure 282*
- 5.3 How to Deal with the Empirical Data:
  - The Buck Survey Revisited 285*
  - Making Comparisons between Regions: Ecological Regions versus Marketing Regions 285*
  - The Productivity of the Land and its Measurement 287*
- 5.4 Toward a Grand Interpretation of the Relationship between Productivity and the Extent of Land Farmed by Tenants and Hired Labor 290
  - The Social Meaning of Land Productivity 290*
  - The Potential Surplus 292*
  - The Proportion of Land on Which the Labor of Others' is Exploited 298*
- 5.5 Population Density and the Prevalence of Rented Land 309
  - Greater Population Density and More Rented Land: The Overview through Interregional Comparison 309*
  - How Population Density Works in Determining Land Tenure Patterns: A Test Comparison of Two Areas 314*

<b>Chapter 6</b>	<b>Urban/Rural Linkages and Population Processes: Marketing, Migration, Malthusian Constraints</b>	<b>320</b>
6.0	Introduction: The Commercial Relations of an Agrarian Society	320
6.1	The Parasitic City Model and Implications for the Flow of the Surplus	330
	<i>Conceptualizing a Social Hierarchy Straddling Countryside and Town</i>	330
	<i>Quantifying the Grain Economy</i>	335
6.2	The Outflow of Agricultural Product from the Countryside: Analysis of Marketing Data	345
6.3	Land/Labor Relations and Subsidiary Occupations in Empirical Data: Circulation of the Surplus	354
	<i>Income from Subsidiary Occupations: Redistributive Effect?</i>	355
	<i>How Much Income from Subsidiary Occupations?</i>	360
	<i>The Farm Economy in Core-Periphery Perspective, and the Occupational Structure of Farm Households</i>	378
6.4	Migration and Movement between Farm and Non-Farm Sectors	395
	<i>The Population Survey Data on Migration</i>	395
	<i>"Non-Resident" Population and the Composition of Migration</i>	397
	<i>Migration, Spatial Differentiation, and Occupation</i>	402
6.5	Land Tenure and Population Processes	406
	<i>Land Tenure and Age at Marriage for Men</i>	408
	<i>Relations of Production and Relations of Reproduction: Foreshadowings of Evolution</i>	412
6.6	Marriage Markets and the "Little Daughter-in-Law" Phenomenon: A Manifestation of Contradictions in the Relations of Reproduction?	415
6.7	Malthusian Musings: Absolute Income and Reproduction	425
6.8	An Explanation for the Transition from High to Low Fertility for the Wealthy in the Process of Industrialization	431
	<i>Demographic Transition: A Detailed Study for Turkey</i>	433
	<i>Landownership, Landholding, Labor</i>	434
	<i>A Conceptual Model of Demographic Transition: Relations of Production</i>	436
	<i>The End of Chapter 6</i>	

<b>Chapter 7</b>	<b>Points of Transition in the Rationale of Land Use: The Sufficiency Threshold and Scale of Ownership for Hiring-In Labor and Renting-Out Land</b>	<b>441</b>
7.0	Introduction	441
7.1	The Valuation of Freedom from Physical Labor in an Agrarian Society	448
7.2	The Sufficiency Threshold for Hiring-In Labor: Establishing the Absolute Level	452
	<i>Detailed Surveys from South Asia</i>	452
	<i>Levels of Landownership and Use of Hired Labor in Chinese Data</i>	457
	<i>Landownership and Use of Hired Labor in North China: The Buck Survey</i>	463
7.3	The Macro-Economic Effects of the Sufficiency Thresholds in Geographical Perspective: The Scale of Farming with Hired Labor	470
7.4	The Macro-Economic Effects of the Sufficiency Threshold in Geographical Perspective: The Scale of Ownership for Hiring-In Labor and for Renting-Out Land	478
	<i>The Minimum Scale of Ownership for Hiring Year Laborers</i>	478
	<i>The Scale of Ownership for Renting-Out Land</i>	483

**PART THREE THE DETERMINATION OF  
THE RATE OF RENT ON AGRICULTURAL LAND**

**Chapter 8 The First-Stage Solution of the Rate of Rent:  
The Leisure of the Rich versus the Hunger of the Poor 494**

8.0 Introduction: Overview of Part Three 494

8.1 Seeking the Absolute Rate of Rent in an Agrarian Society:  
Subsistence and Surplus 499

8.2 The Landownership Distribution:  
Measuring Alienation from the Means of Production 505

8.3 How Could Rent Equal the Surplus? 512

8.4 The Strategies of the Land-Short Population 516

8.5 What if the Land-Short Population Can't Get Enough Rented Land? 520

8.6 The Range of Solutions for the Rate of Rent Under  
Varying Conditions of Productivity 525

**Chapter 9 The Rate of Rent and the Rate of Extraction in Agrarian  
Society: Structural Leaps, Geographical Reversals 530**

9.0 Introduction 520

9.1 Is There a Logic to the Total Rate of Extraction in Agrarian Society? 535  
*The Rate of Extraction under a Unitary Land/Labor Relationship 541*  
*Two States of Equilibrium for the Agrarian Economy 546*  
*A Second-Stage Refinement for the Absolute Rate of Rent,  
Somewhat Tentative 546*

9.2 The Source of the Empirical Data on the Rate of Rent 550

9.3 Comparison of the Theory of the Rate of Rent with Empirical Data 556

9.4 Land/Labor Relations and Rents in the Context of Geography 562  
*The Marginal Productivity Version of the Association between  
High Population Density and High Rents 564*  
*Population Density and the Determination  
of the Absolute Rate of Rent 567*  
*Alternative Sources of Subsistence, Demand for Rented Land,  
and the Rate of Rent 569*

9.5 The Allocation of Rented Land: Profits or Penury 579  
*Surplus Areas: If the Surplus on Rented Land is High,  
Rich Farmers Want It 579*  
*Deficit Areas: If Rent is Higher Than the Surplus,  
Only Rich Farmers Can Benefit from Rented Land 583*

9.6 A Further Examination of the Empirical Landownership Distribution and  
the Theoretical Effect of the Level of Inequality on the Rate of Rent 586  
*Comparing the Numbers of Land-Short Population 587*  
*Comparing the Theoretical Landownership Distribution  
with the Landownership Distribution for North China 589*

9.7 Levels of Inequality in Landownership Distribution  
and their Theoretical Impact on the Rate of Rent 596

9.8 A Summary of the Determination of the Absolute Rate of Rent  
and its Impact on the Forms of the Agrarian Economy 599  
*Three Stages of the Determination of the Absolute Rate of Rent 599*  
*A Typology of Chinese Agricultural Economies 602*

**Chapter 10 Conclusions and Implications of the  
Economics of Inequality in an Agrarian Society 606**

- 10.0 Introduction 606
- 10.1 A Summary of Theory and Findings on the  
Economics of Inequality in an Agrarian Society 608
- 10.2 An Evolutionary Scenario:  
Increasing Population Density and the Relations of Production 620  
*Decreasing Marginal Productivity  
and the "Nurksian" Point of No Return 620*  
*The Pace of Population Growth 622*  
*Applying the Magnitudes Found in Empirical Data to the Scenario 624*  
*The Evolution of Relations of Production and Class Structure 628*  
*Are the Characteristics of Feudalism Set by Low Population Density? 630*  
*"Capitalist" Renters Profiting from Hired Labor 632*  
*Tenants: Exploited and Free 633*
- 10.3 The Mode of Production:  
Feudal, Petty-Commodity, Capitalist — Or None of the Above? 636  
*Is Extraction of the Surplus Prior to Capitalism "Non-Economic"? 636*  
*Is Class Struggle Irrelevant to the  
Long-Term Structure of Land/Labor Relations? 638*  
*Modes versus Processes in Delineating Social Formations 640*  
*The Existence of Markets Does Not Imply Equalization 642*
- 10.4 Researchers of the World Unite! The Next Five-Year Plan 645

**Bibliography 648**

**Appendices 663**

- A Indicators for Ranking of Localities by Economic Status —  
Data from Buck, Chinese Farm Economy, 1930 664
- B Family Members' Relation to Head of Household, by  
Economic Status of Locality — Buck 1930, Chinese Farm Economy 665
- C Age and Sex Distributions for Localities Ranked by HI, MED or LO  
Economic Status — Buck 1930, Chinese Farm Economy 672
- D Comparison of Farm Economy, Food Intake, and Population Age-Sex  
Distribution, with County Samples Organized by Geographical Region  
and HI/LO Economic Well-Being — Buck 1937 and Notestein Archives 676
- E Issues in the Recompilation of the Buck Survey Data 688
- F Calculate Land Rented Out (RO) and Rent to Subsist (RS) for a  
Landownership Distribution with 42% Displacement from Equality 689
- G Fluctuations in Rate of Rent Solution  
(Matrices for Product per Capita by Sufficiency Threshold)  
*Rate of Rent at Sufficiency Threshold 691*  
*Land Rented Out at Sufficiency Threshold 692*  
*Extraction from Renters at Sufficiency Threshold 693*  
*Estimated Landlord Population 694*  
*Average Extraction per Capita of Farm Population 695*
- H The Effects of Population Density: Approximation of the  
Empirical Data by Multiple Linear Regression 696
- I Mathematical Approximations of the Landownership Distribution 704